## **ONTARIO**

## SUPERIOR COURT OF JUSTICE

BETWEEN:

# CHARLES C. ROACH, ASHOK CHARLES, MICHAEL MCATEER AND HOWARD JEROME GOMBERG

**Applicants** 

-and-

### THE ATTORNEY GENERAL OF CANADA

Respondent

#### **AFFIDAVIT OF DROR BAR-NATAN**

I, DROR BAR-NATAN, of the City of Toronto in the Province of Ontario, AFFIRM AS FOLLOWS:

- This Affidavit is written to provide evidence in support of a motion that I be added to the Application within as an Applicant and, should such a motion be granted, as evidence to be used in the hearing of the Application itself.
- 2. I was born on January 30, 1966, in Kiryat-Gat, Israel, to Naomi Bar-Natan, an Israeli born in the United States, and to Shaul Bar-Natan, an Israeli born in Syria. My father's sole citizenship was Israeli, and my mother and I are citizens of both the United States and of Israel.
- 3. I have lived in Israel and in the United States until July 2002, over the years obtaining a Ph.D. in mathematical physics from Princeton University, teaching for a number of years at Harvard University, and eventually achieving the rank of an associate professor with tenure at the Hebrew University in Jerusalem.

- 4. I am married to Yael Karshon whose career path has been similar to mine. We are parents of Assaf (born 1993) and Itai (born 1996).
- 5. On July 31, 2002, I moved with my family to Toronto, Canada.
- 6. My wife and I were both appointed as associate professors of mathematics at the University of Toronto. We were both promoted to full professors in 2006, and presently we both still work at U. of T. as researchers in mathematics and teachers of mathematics.
- 7. While resident in Toronto, I have published numerous articles in scientific journals, taught thousands of undergraduate students, hundreds of graduate students, and supervised or am supervising about 10 Ph.D. students and several post-doctoral fellows. As a resident of Canada, I have lectured extensively domestically and internationally, I have been awarded a number of research grants, and I maintain an extensive scientific web presence. I have performed significant administrative duties within my university.
- 8. The primary reasons for our move out of Israel have been political and cultural. I did not want to live in an area of the world that is in a permanent state of conflict, and I found it hard to live in a place where one's ancestry determines so much of his/her future.
- 9. Before moving to Canada, my wife and I both lived for about a decade in the United States, where my wife was a permanent resident and I was a citizen, and we knew and know that country very well. Yet we have chosen to move to Canada, which we had only visited briefly before. I used to tell my friends that I see Canada as a "kinder, gentler America", and this, along with having established roots here, remains the reason we wish to stay and play a role in Canadian life.
- 10. My wife and I and our children became permanent residents of Canada in June, 2005. My wife and children became Canadian citizens in January 2011.

- 11. In January 2008, around the time that we became eligible to apply for Canadian citizenship, I realized, because of the requirement of taking the oath of citizenship that includes affirming allegiance to the Canadian monarch, I would not be able to become a Canadian citizen along with my family. I have not become a Canadian citizen since.
- 12. I find the phrase "I affirm that I will be faithful and bear true allegiance to Her Majesty Queen Elizabeth II, Queen of Canada, Her Heirs and Successors" repulsive. To me, it states that some people, the royals and their heirs, are born with privilege. It is a historic remnant of a time we all believe has passed, in which the children of peasants could be nothing but peasants, and in which aristocracy existed as a closed club.
- 13. I appreciate that the monarchy in Canada is mostly symbolic (I could not live here had it been anything more). Yet it is precisely the wrong symbol: a symbol that we aren't all equal and that some of us have to bow to others for reasons of ancestry alone.
- 14. I could and can live in Canada ignoring the monarchy and enjoying all else that is wonderful here. But I feel that affirming allegiance to what I think is wrong would be a violation of my conscience that I would find very difficult to do. I find the thought of having to violate my conscience in this way very bitter to swallow.
- 15. I should stress that I see nothing wrong with the second half of the oath, that "I will faithfully observe the laws of Canada and fulfil my duties as a Canadian citizen". Indeed, I faithfully observe the laws of Canada and I am looking forward to fulfilling my duties as a Canadian citizen. I accept that acceptance of the Canadian laws is reasonable to require of new Canadians.
- 16. Yet I feel that the requirement of taking the (first half of) the oath is tantamount to hazing. To be initiated as a Canadian, I am required to participate in an initiation ritual that I find disturbing and humiliating. It is a ritual that has no practical meaning and only carries what I regard as a repugnant symbolic meaning. Moreover, it is a ritual that born-Canadians are not subject to.

- 17. I therefore wish to be added as an Applicant to this Application so that I can have the courts consider the possibility of relieving me of the necessity of affirming my allegiance to the monarchy of Canada as a part of the process of becoming Canadian.
- 18. There are many reasons that I wish to become a Canadian citizen, including obtaining the right to vote in elections and the right to travel on a Canadian passport.
- 19. I feel there is much value in becoming a Canadian citizen. Should this Application be dismissed and possible subsequent appeals be denied, I will likely hold my nose and shut my eyes, surrender to some hazing and unhappily take the oath of citizenship in contradiction to my conscientious beliefs as indicated above.
- 20. Should that happen, I will be bound in allegiance to the monarchy, and unlike born-Canadians, I will be morally bound to support it. Thus my first act as a new Canadian citizen would be to write the monarch in person and request to be relieved of my obligations to her.
- 21. This Affidavit is for the purpose of providing evidence on a motion to add me as an Applicant and evidence on the Application itself, and for no other or improper purpose.

Affirmed before me at the City of Toronto			)	
this	day of September, 2012	)		
			)	
		)		
	Peter Rosenthal			DROR BAR-NATAN
	A Commissioner, etc.			